

Evaluation of BBSRC's David Phillips fellowship scheme

Appendices

Appendix 1: Review Panel membership	68
Appendix 2: Questionnaires	69

Appendix 1

Review Panel membership

Professor Steve Yeaman (Chair)

Institute of Cellular Medicine, Newcastle University

Professor Nick Brewin

Emeritus Fellow, John Innes Centre / Independent

Dr Helen Cassaday

Institute of Neuroscience, University of Nottingham

Dr Shirley Ellis

Institute of Animal Health, Compton

Dr Jonathan Powell

Independent

Professor Sheena Radford

Astbury Centre for Structural Molecular Biology, University of Leeds

Observers

Dr Candy Hassall

Head of Basic Careers, Wellcome Trust

Dr Paul McDonald

Head of Grants, Royal Society

Appendix 2

Questionnaires

An example of the questionnaire sent to former fellows is at page 70.

An example of the questionnaire sent to fellowship applicants is at page 87.

The questionnaire sent to current fellows is not included. This was very similar to the former fellow questionnaire; some minor changes were made to the question wording, as the awards were still active.

EVALUATION OF BBSRC FELLOWSHIP SUPPORT FOR EARLY-CAREER SCIENTISTS

Survey of former fellowship award holders

Thank you for participating in the evaluation of BBSRC fellowship support for early-career scientists. Please complete as many questions as possible and return to Dr. Paul Reeves, preferably by e-mail, by **Monday 20th April**. An electronic version of this questionnaire will be sent to you in the next few days. If completing by hand, please feel free to continue your answers on a separate sheet.

YOUR DETAILS

Name:

Institution:

Please note:

- The text in the questionnaire refers to BBSRC early-career fellowships. In recent years, they have been known as David Phillips Fellowships; prior to this, they were known by other names, such as Junior Fellowships.
- The objective of this evaluation is to assess BBSRC fellowship support for early career scientists **as a whole**. There is no intent to make judgments on the performance of individual fellows.
- The survey consists of 32 questions. To help reduce the time taken to complete the questionnaire we have used multiple choice, 'tick-box' questions where possible. However, we would still appreciate your written comments.
- The information you provide on your fellowships outputs and outcomes will be used to update your fellowship's final report. All other responses will be collated and made **non-attributable** before being viewed by the Review Panel or BBSRC staff.

A: YOUR FELLOWSHIP APPLICATION

1. At the time of your application, had you taken a career break from research?

Please mark one box and provide brief comments if you wish

Yes	
No	

If yes, how long had it been since you returned from a career break at the time of your application?

	✓
Less than 1 year	
1 – 2 years	
More than 2 years	

2. To what extent did the Fellowship’s eligibility criteria influence your decision to apply? e.g. support for career breaks, restrictions on previous post-doctoral experience

Please mark one box and provide brief comments if you wish

5 strongly encouraged application	4 encouraged application	3 no influence on decision to apply	2 discouraged application	1 strongly discouraged application

3. To what extent did the following influence your decision to apply for a BBSRC fellowship?

- Fellowship provides a research support grant in addition to salary
- Number of fellowships available relative to other schemes (i.e. likely success rate)
- Prestige of the BBSRC fellowship award
- Limited opportunities within the UK available to apply for funding to establish an independent research programme

Please mark one box for each item and provide brief comments if you wish

Influence on your decision to apply	5 strongly encouraged application	4 encouraged application	3 no influence on decision to apply	2 discouraged application	1 strongly discouraged application
Fellowship supports research activities					
Number of fellowships available					
Prestige of fellowship					
Limited funding opportunities available					

4. What would you have done if you had not been awarded the fellowship?

Please mark all that apply and provide brief comments if you wish

Intention	✓
I was offered another fellowship which I would have accepted (please specify)	
I would have applied for other fellowships	
I would have gained more experience in another post-doctoral research position, before applying for fellowships later in my career	
I would have applied for permanent academic positions e.g. university lectureships	
I would have sought a non-academic research post e.g. industry	
I would have pursued a non-scientific career path	
Other – please specify	

B: YOUR FELLOWSHIP AWARD AND CAREER DEVELOPMENT

5. In your opinion, how successful was your fellowship in meeting its research objectives? *Please mark one box*

4 very successful	3 successful	2 somewhat successful	1 not at all successful

6. Did any of the following have a negative impact on your ability to meet your fellowship's research objectives:-

Please mark all boxes that apply and provide brief comments if you wish

Reason	✓
Staffing difficulties (see below)	
I was unable to recruit someone with the necessary qualifications and experience	
Staff temporarily stopped work during the grant (e.g. illness, career break)	
Staff left during the grant, so I had to re-recruit	
Other – please specify	
Experimental, methodological or technical issues	
Lack of resources (e.g. funding, equipment)	
Unrealistic objectives	
'High risk' hypothesis	
Forced to change research direction (e.g. by publication of new data by other investigators)	
Regulatory procedures or ethical issues	
Uncertainty about your employment / tenure	

7. How would you rate the support from your host institution? Please comment with regards to provision of:

- **Laboratory space**
- **Laboratory equipment**
- **Access to facilities**
- **Research staff** (e.g. technical support)
- **Mentoring and career development**

Please mark one box for each item and provide brief comments if you wish

Provision of:	4 very good	3 good	2 fair	1 poor
Laboratory space				
Laboratory equipment				
Access to facilities e.g. animal facilities, plant growth facilities				
Research staff				
Mentoring and career development e.g. advice with preparing grant applications, involvement in management roles within the institution				

8. How helpful was the non-financial support provided by BBSRC during your fellowship? e.g. annual feedback, media training, Fellows' conferences

Please mark one box and provide brief comments if you wish

4 very helpful	3 helpful	2 somewhat helpful	1 not at all helpful

9. Please comment on the benefits, if any, you received from attending the Fellows' conference.

MANAGEMENT SKILLS

10. At the start of your fellowship, to what extent had your previous training prepared you to manage an independent research group? (e.g. managing staff, managing projects) *Please mark one box and provide brief comments if you wish*

4 very well prepared	3 well prepared	2 somewhat prepared	1 not at all prepared

11. Did you receive any formal training to develop your management skills during your Fellowship?

Yes	
No (but formal training would have been useful)	
No (but formal training would not have been useful)	

If yes, how useful was it?

4 very useful	3 useful	2 somewhat useful	1 not at all useful

FURTHER FUNDING

- Please note: We already have the details of the further funding reported in your final report, as well as any further funding from BBSRC.

12. Have you applied for or secured further funding since completing your fellowship?

	Yes	No
Applied for further funding		
Secured further funding		

If you secured further funding, please provide details on **non-BBSRC** grants:

Funding Agency	Award Type (e.g. Research grant, studentship)	Value (£)	Duration (months)

13. Please comment on any difficulties/issues related to securing funding during your fellowship. e.g. did your host institution prevent you from applying for research grants or studentships when your fellowship was nearing completion?

YOUR RESEARCH CAREER

14. How did the fellowship facilitate the progress of your career?

Please mark all that apply and provide brief comments if you wish

	✓
Helped me establish my research programme	
Helped me win further funding	
Helped me secure promotion / new job	
Motivated me to stay in research	
Other – please specify	
The fellowship did not facilitate the progress of my career	

15. What is your current position?

Please mark one box and provide brief comments if you wish

Position	✓
Independent Fellow	
Lecturer	
Senior Lecturer	
Reader	
Professor	
Other – please specify	

16. If applicable, please provide details of the number of current full time equivalent (FTE) staff employed within your research group, as well as associated students.

Staff	No. of current FTE employees
Post-doctoral researchers	
Research Assistants	
Technicians	
PhD students	
MSc students	
Undergraduate students	

PROFESSIONAL RECOGNITION

17. Please list any professional bodies on which you serve and any other professional recognition you have received

e.g. journal editorial boards, funding Committees, strategy panels, awards, invited conference presentations etc.

Professional Recognition	✓	Brief Details
Professional bodies (see below)		
Journal editorial boards		
Funding Committees		
Strategy Panels		
Other professional bodies – please specify		
Awards		
<u>Invited</u> conference presentations		
Other – please specify		

C: RESEARCH OUTPUTS

18. Please list all further publications arising from your fellowship since your final report was produced, including those that are 'in press' or accepted for publication

There is no need to provide us with information that is already contained within your final report. Please list publications in the following two categories and ensure that the full reference is included:

Original research articles in refereed journals

General articles – e.g. review articles, book chapters, articles in popular magazines

Please note we do not require any information on conferences or poster presentations

19. How many of these publications, including those listed in your final report, had co-authors based overseas or in industry?

Publication type	Overseas	Industry
Original research articles		
General articles		

D. RESEARCH OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS

- It is increasingly important for BBSRC to demonstrate the wider impacts of research funding to government
- BBSRC recognises that it may take considerable time for the wider economic and social impacts of research to be realised
- When answering the following questions please refer to the **direct outputs** of your fellowship, or to **indirect outputs** from your wider research programme that were **significantly underpinned** by the fellowship

For indirect outputs, please provide brief details of how they relate to your fellowship.

PRODUCTS AND INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY

20. Did any new products, processes, resources, tools or technologies result from your fellowship? *e.g. collections, reagents, software, databases, methodology*

Yes	
No	
Likely to in the future	

Please provide details where relevant:

Description of product, process, resource, tool, or technology	
Who are the (potential) users? For what purpose do (or will) they use it?	
How was/will it be made accessible to others?	
Does it have the potential to be commercially exploitable?	
What impact has it had on researchers and on the community as a whole?	
Is the resource still accessible and relevant, or has it been superseded by new technologies?	

21. Have you or your colleagues applied, or are you likely to apply, for any patents or other form of intellectual property rights as a result of the research supported by your fellowship?

Please note: Any information provided by you will be treated as confidential and will not be released into the public domain without your prior approval.

Yes	
No	
Likely to apply	

Please provide details where relevant:

Description of intellectual property	Has it been licensed to companies?	Has the licence yielded any income? (please give details with dates)

22. Have you or your colleagues established any start-up companies from the research supported by your fellowship?

Yes	
No	
Likely to in the future	

If yes, please provide details:

Company name						
Current status	Trading		Dormant		Ceased trading	
Date of incorporation						
Antecedents						
Sector and area of activity						
Number of FTE (full time equivalent) staff currently employed						
Audited turnover in FY 2007/2008						
Audited profit (loss)						
URL of company website						
Other relevant information						

PARTNERSHIPS

23. Did any new academic collaborations or networks develop from your fellowship?

- Please distinguish between informal (new and improved contacts) and formal (joint publication, joint funding application) partnerships links
- Please indicate whether any partnership links are multidisciplinary and state the discipline (e.g. chemistry, physics, computing)
- Please indicate whether any partnership links were formed as a result of BBSRC events (e.g. Fellows' conference, workshops).

Partnership links	Details (collaborator, subject area)	Country (e.g. UK, USA)	Multi-disciplinary?	BBSRC event?
New or improved contacts				
New formal research collaboration				
Other (please specify)				

24. Did any new or improved collaborations with industry, commerce or other non-academic end-users develop from your fellowship?

Partnership links	Details (collaborator, subject area)	Country (e.g. UK, USA)	Sector (e.g. pharmaceuticals, agriculture)
New or improved contacts			
New formal research collaboration (e.g. joint publication, joint funding application)			
Other (please specify)			

WIDER BENEFITS TO THE PUBLIC GOOD

- BBSRC recognises the contribution your research makes to society through the provision of knowledge and the training of staff
- We are also interested in learning about the wider benefits of your research to the public good

25. Has your fellowship contributed to outcomes of benefit to the public good, or is it likely to in the future?

Please distinguish between benefits that have been realised to date, and potential benefits that may arise in the future. Feel free to include benefits from your wider research programme, but please indicate how they relate to your fellowship.

Wider benefit	✓	Details
Human health		
Animal health and welfare		
Environment		
Contribution to the formulation of government policy, or meeting government priorities		
Contribution to the reduction, refinement and replacement of animals in experiments		
Other – please specify:		

E. APPLICATION AND ADMINISTRATION PROCEDURES

26. What is your opinion of the application and administration processes for BBSRC's early-career fellowships? *Please mark one box for each item*

	4 very good	3 good	2 fair	1 poor
Overall				
Application form				
Speed of application process				
Timing/number of calls for the scheme				
Eligibility criteria				
Assessment criteria				
Transparency				
Feedback on application				
Helpfulness of Research Council staff				

27. Please provide comments, if any, on BBSRC's application and assessment processes for early-career fellowships

F: GENERAL

28. To what extent was the support provided by your fellowship sufficient to establish a sustainable research programme? Please comment with regards to

- **the size of awards**
- **the duration of awards**

Please mark one box for each item and provide brief comments if you wish. The level of support has changed over time. Please answer with regards to the support provided by the fellowship at the time you received your award.

	4 more than sufficient	3 sufficient	2 somewhat sufficient	1 not at all sufficient
Size of awards				
Duration of awards				

29. Given limited BBSRC resources, how would you rate the balance between the number of awards and the financial support provided?

Please mark one box and provide brief comments if you wish

5 There should be more awards of less value	4	3 Balance is appropriate	2	1 There should be fewer awards of greater value

30. How would you rate BBSRC’s early-career fellowships compared to similar fellowship awards from other funding agencies?

Please indicate whether BBSRC early-career fellowships are better, same or worse than other specific fellowships of which you are aware. Please give brief reasons for your choice

Funding Agency	Is the BBSRC fellowship better, same or worse than this fellowship?			Reason
	BBSRC is better	BBSRC is the same	BBSRC is worse	
Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council				
European Science Foundation				
Human Frontiers Science Programme				
Leverhulme Trust				
Medical Research Council				
Natural Environment Research Council				
Research Councils UK				
Royal Society				
Science and Technology Facilities Council				
Wellcome Trust				
Other – please specify				

31. Please provide comments, if any, on how BBSRC could improve its fellowship support for early-career researchers.

32. Please provide any other comments relevant to this evaluation

Thank you very much, your contribution is greatly appreciated

EVALUATION OF BBSRC FELLOWSHIP SUPPORT FOR EARLY-CAREER SCIENTISTS

Survey of fellowship applicants

Thank you for participating in the evaluation of BBSRC fellowship support for early-career scientists. Please complete as many questions as possible and return to Dr. Paul Reeves, preferably by e-mail, by **Monday 18th May**. If completing by hand, please feel free to continue your answers on a separate sheet.

YOUR DETAILS

Name:

Institution:

Please note:

- The text in the questionnaire refers to BBSRC early-career fellowships. In recent years, they have been known as David Phillips Fellowships or Institute Career Path Fellowships.
- The survey consists of ten questions and should take less than 15 minutes to complete. To help reduce the time taken to complete the questionnaire we have used multiple choice, 'tick-box' questions where possible. However, we would still appreciate your written comments.
- All responses will be collated and made **non-attributable** before being viewed by the Review Panel or BBSRC staff.

A: YOUR FELLOWSHIP APPLICATION

1. At the time of your application, had you taken a career break from research?

Please mark one box and provide brief comments if you wish

Yes	
No	

If yes, how long had it been since you returned from a career break at the time of your application?

	✓
Less than 1 year	
1 – 2 years	
More than 2 years	

2. To what extent did the Fellowship’s eligibility criteria influence your decision to apply? e.g. support for career breaks, restrictions on previous post-doctoral experience

Please mark one box and provide brief comments if you wish

5 strongly encouraged application	4 encouraged application	3 no influence on decision to apply	2 discouraged application	1 strongly discouraged application

3. To what extent did the following influence your decision to apply for a BBSRC fellowship?

- Fellowship provides a research support grant in addition to salary
- Number of fellowships available relative to other schemes (i.e. likely success rate)
- Prestige of the BBSRC fellowship award
- Limited opportunities within the UK available to apply for funding to establish an independent research programme

Please mark one box for each item and provide brief comments if you wish

Influence on your decision to apply	5 strongly encouraged application	4 encouraged application	3 no influence on decision to apply	2 discouraged application	1 strongly discouraged application
Fellowship supports research activities					
Number of fellowships available					
Prestige of fellowship					
Limited funding opportunities available					

4. What career path have you followed since making your fellowship application?

Please mark all that apply and provide brief comments if you wish

Intention	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
I was offered another fellowship which I accepted (please specify)	
I have applied or intend to apply for other fellowships	
I have gained or intend to gain more experience as a post-doctoral researcher position, and will apply again for fellowships later in my career	
I have applied or intend to apply for permanent academic positions e.g. university lectureships	
I have pursued or intend to pursue a non-academic research career e.g. industry	
I have pursued or intend to pursue a non-scientific career path	
Other – please specify	

B. APPLICATION AND ADMINISTRATION PROCEDURES

5. What is your opinion of the application and administration processes for BBSRC's early-career fellowships? *Please mark one box for each item*

	4 very good	3 good	2 fair	1 poor
Overall				
Application form				
Speed of application process				
Timing/number of calls for the scheme				
Eligibility criteria				
Assessment criteria				
Transparency				
Feedback on application				
Helpfulness of Research Council staff				

6. Please provide comments, if any, on BBSRC's application and assessment processes for early-career fellowships

C: GENERAL

7. Given limited BBSRC resources, how would you rate the balance between the number of awards and the financial support provided?

Please mark one box and provide brief comments if you wish

5 There should be more awards of less value	4	3 Balance is appropriate	2	1 There should be fewer awards of greater value

8. How would you rate BBSRC's early-career fellowships compared to similar fellowship awards from other funding agencies?

Please indicate whether BBSRC early-career fellowships are better, same or worse than other specific fellowships of which you are aware. Please give brief reasons for your choice

Funding Agency	Is the BBSRC fellowship better, same or worse than this fellowship?			Reason
	BBSRC is better	BBSRC is the same	BBSRC is worse	
Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council				
European Science Foundation				
Human Frontiers Science Programme				
Leverhulme Trust				
Medical Research Council				
Natural Environment Research Council				
Research Councils UK				
Royal Society				
Science and Technology Facilities Council				
Wellcome Trust				
Other – please specify				

9. Please provide comments, if any, on how BBSRC could improve its fellowship support for early-career researchers.

10. Please provide any other comments relevant to this evaluation

Thank you very much, your contribution is greatly appreciated